Legends Long Since Localised or Tales Still Travelling?

ALAN BRUFORD

This paper is designed to kill several birds with one stone: to correct some errors in an earlier note of mine in *Scottish Studies* 17(''The King's Three Questions' in Scotland''); to draw attention to a body of newly-collected Scots folktales not previously noticed in this journal; and to anticipate some conclusions of a long-delayed catalogue of Scottish fairy legends. It is primarily provoked, however, by some surprising statements in Dr David Buchan's analysis of 'The Legend of the Lughnasa Musician in Lowland Britain' in *Scottish Studies* 23 (Buchan 1979). The catalogue section of his paper is undeniably useful though not exhaustive.[1] Some of its conclusions, on the other hand, seem to me to betray a brand of romanticism which I should be sorry to see appearing in this journal unchallenged.

The title itself is misleading. Máire MacNeill's *The Festival of Lughnasa*, undoubtedly an 'exhaustive study', actually contains only *one* story in which a piper (and companions) disappear in a cave or passage underground, that from Teltown which Buchan calls 'the fullest of the Irish versions' (MacNeill 1962:668). Despite the implication in MacNeill's introduction to this, quoted by Buchan, that a similar though less complete motif has turned up 'at several sites', the only other conceivably relevant story mentioned in the book, that is to say the only one where a mortal musician disappears underground, is one from Slieve Rushen, Co. Cavan, where 'many years ago a fiddler went into the cave to play a few tunes and was never seen again, but sounds of fiddler's music and fairy dancing are heard from inside . . .' (MacNeill 1962:175). The fact that after a thorough search of the Irish Folklore Commission's manuscripts no other version was found connected with any of the 195 'Lughnasa sites', and these include many of the important places in Ireland otherwise associated with the fairies and over twenty caves (mostly inland) or supposed underground passages, surely suggests that our story may well be *less* common in Ireland than in Scotland, where we know of at least thirty versions. On present evidence, in fact, it seems more likely to have been imported from Britain to Ireland, not necessarily very long before the Teltown legend was noted by O'Donovan in 1836, and attached to a couple of 'Lughnasa sites' and no doubt to other places: much less likely that it came from Ireland to Britain with the invading Scots or later. There is thus no reason to associate the legend, at least as known in Britain, with the

rites and beliefs belonging to the festival of Lughnasa or Lammas, or to postulate a lost myth of a raid on an underground treasury led by a piper.[2]

There is also no reason to think that Gaelic versions are necessarily older than Lowland Scots ones: bagpipes of some sort can be traced back as far in the Lowlands as they can in the Highlands, and the number of Highland locations for the legend is actually less than the Lowland ones. This is not clear from the article by Daniel Melia (1967) which links MacNeill to Buchan: Melia is less careful than either of the others about assigning legends to 'sites', and draws only on accounts accompanying some versions of the two songs, *Uamh an Oir* (The Cave of Gold) and *Cha till MacCruimein* (MacCrimmon will never return), recently dealt with in this journal by Virginia Blankenhorn (1978), and on the chapter dealing with the legend in W. L. Manson's *The Highland Bagpipe* (Manson 1901:247–56).

The songs all appear to be associated with Skye sites. In fact there seem to be at least three sites for *Uamh an Oir* in Skye, two of them in MacDonald rather than MacLeod territory, which suggests that the legend may have been taken over by the MacCrimmons, pipers to MacLeod of Dunvegan, from the MacArthurs, pipers to MacDonald of Sleat. A good many versions even from Skye do not call the piper a MacCrimmon, and at least one account (MacGregor 1947:169, located at Bornasciotaig—see below) calls him a MacArthur, though some recent oral versions set in other islands, including two out of three from Islay, make the piper there a MacCrimmon. Over the past century and a half no other family of hereditary pipers has had such a share of the limelight, and naturally they get more than their share of the stories too. K. N. MacDonald (1901:48) gives both a 'MacLeod country version', which agrees with the account given by Frances Tolmie (1911:157), and may derive from her, and a 'Trotternish version'. According to the first the cave is at Harlosh, which answers Manson's vague location 'four miles from Dunvegan', but to the south-east rather than the south-west as Miss Tolmie says. In the Trotternish version the cave is near Monkstadt: according to the first version this is actually the other end of the Harlosh cave. It seems doubtful whether this can be the same as the cave marked on the 1 inch Ordnance Survey map as 'Uamh Oir' (NG 372719), near Bornasciotaig in Kilmuir, as mentioned by MacGregor and by Martin Martin in the seventeenth century, which is over two miles north of Monkstadt House. Martin gives it no name but makes it the site of the legend, but he mentions another Uamh an Oir in Sleat, no doubt running from shore to shore of the peninsula, which may well once have been associated with the legend also:

> There is a big cave in the village Bornskittag, which is supposed to exceed a mile in length. The natives told me that a piper, who was over-curious, went into the cave with a design to find out the length of it; and after he entered began to play on his pipe, but never returned to give an account of his progress. . . .
>
> The Golden Cave in Sleat is said to be seven miles in length, from the west to the east. (Martin 1934:204, 205).

Without giving a catalogue, it may be worth listing the other Highland sites. Melia only mentions three of Manson's sites, Skye (Harlosh), Mull (Gribun), and [mainland] Inverness-shire (Glen Nevis). In fact Manson's chapter also mentions legends from Dundarave near Inveraray, Durness in Sutherland, and two non-Gaelic versions overlooked by Buchan from Keill in Kintyre and Glasgow Cathedral,[3] as well as a version of his Edn 1. Except for the Glen Nevis site he quotes enough to make it clear that in all these versions the piper finally disappears, though in one from Dunnet Head, Caithness (a variant of Buchan's Cai 1) he escapes after a year, as in a different legend discussed below. To the supplementary list given by Buchan (1979:36) which covers versions from Arran, Barra, Colonsay, mainland Argyll and Wester Ross as well as variants of those already mentioned, and his West Perthshire versions (Per 1, 2, 3 in Buchan 1979:29) which are clearly originally Gaelic though the third is normally a different story,[4] we may add his reference to 'School of Scottish Studies Archives', though in fact recordings so far indexed only add one further site, near Port Askaig in Islay. Finally we must mention a story from Kintail, recorded by Ian Paterson from Mrs Kate Dix, Berneray, Harris (SA 1968/255 A7): though this is not a version of our legend, since the musician involved is a fairy set to discourage intruders, it does for once include the element of the party which disappears having set out to rob the fairies in the cave of their treasure, and would surely delight Buchan, Melia and MacNeill.[5]

Dispassionately viewed, therefore, the legend of the piper in the cave is a fairly ordinary migratory legend type as defined by Christiansen (1958) and may well be paralleled outside the British Isles, though it is not mentioned by Christiansen himself or in the very comprehensive Finnish legend catalogue of Simonsuuri (1961). More precisely, perhaps, it is a migratory motif used to add narrative substance to what may often be pre-existing traditions about caves, which fall into three main groups. The one found in most of the island variants and occasionally inland maintains that a cave on one side of an island, peninsula or mountain range runs right through it and comes out at the other side: the piper's death in trying to verify this serves as a warning to take the tradition on trust, but the emergence of his dog at the far end may be added to show it is true.[6] The belief is known as far north as Orkney and Shetland: I have heard it in North Ronaldsay and Mrs Saxby (1932:51–2) gives an example from the furthest north point of the British Isles, Burrafirth in Unst. Here the Will-Helyer is a cave filled by the sea, so the warning legend is of a boatload of young men vanishing, but the wreckage of their boat being found on the far side of the island at Norwick. The inland tradition is usually of a secret passage leading into a castle or other ancient monument, or linking two such places: it is common without the legend attached. There is also a third group where the cave is simply of unknown length: in most cases these are coastal caves and Manson's implied suggestion that the story was put about by smugglers to discourage investigation (Manson 1901:251) is very reasonable.

It certainly does not seem likely that the legend has always been attached to its 'sites' since pagan times: since the Gaels were Christian before they reached the great majority of the Scottish 'sites' for the legend, and there is no evidence for the cult of Lug in Pictland, there is indeed no reason why the legend or its postulated mythic precursor should have been attached to them *in* pagan times. Thus it is wild romanticism to suggest that non-Gaelic versons 'come from some deep-down stratum of the region's cultural history. A time-span that in the case of the English versions must stretch back for the legend's Celtic roots to a time before the Saxon invasions of [the] fifth century AD is really rather striking' (Buchan 1979:22). What I want to consider in the following pages is whether there is ever any justification for talking in such terms of *any* demonstrably migratory tale (one must of course rule out those based on undoubted historical fact or personal experience, or confined or overwhelmingly linked to a single place.) Can we speak of major plot elements, rather than surface details, as 'Celtic' rather than Germanic? Dare we attempt to date the arrival in a country or region of a legend or international tale-type (*Märchen*), and suggest where it came from, or is this just an amusing waste of time? Are stories still migrating, did they move more or less freely when storytelling was commoner but travel was rarer, and has *any* legend not fixed by print been associated with one place for 1000 years or more?

All these questions cannot be answered here, but some examples may help to suggest probabilities. Taking the undeniably mobile international tale-types first, we need not adopt the modern extremist position—denying that tale-types exist, or at least are of any interest, and concentrating solely on each telling of a story as a unique creative event—to realize that some ideas which were gospel fifty years ago have gone forever. The 'ripple theory' of diffusion, for instance, is just too simple to fit many cases, and von Sydow's original use of the botanical term 'ecotype' for national variants which he saw as often having split off from a parent type during an age of migrations before the Christian era (von Sydow 1948:55–9) must be amended in scale and date on the basis of reliable type studies, even if the ideas of racial purity which can be glimpsed behind it were not now discredited. In fact my study of native Gaelic tales showed that something akin to ecotype on a local rather than national scale can easily develop in stories derived from romances written as recently as the sixteenth century—and so, incidentally, can the sort of linking with a site in the storyteller's own locality typical of migratory legend (Bruford 1965*a*:13–22; 1969:82, 93 *etc.*, 216).

One tenet of the Finnish School which has stood the test of time rather better is that *Märchen* at least move easily from one language to another, so that a well-known Irish variant of AT 875 whose hero is the Gobán Saor could be recorded in English in Victorian Deptford as 'The Gobborn Seer' (Jacobs 1894:54). Stories may easily travel much further than that, not necessarily in 'ripples' or along obvious routes. When writing my note on 'The King's Three Questions (AT 922) in Scotland' (Bruford

1973:149) I had difficulty in accounting for the element of the skull in the version of the type, 'Domhnall Ruadh and the Skull', printed there in full as recorded from Donald John MacKinnon, the Barra bard. In fact this story of the skull, which speaks only to say 'Speaking sent me here' and then says nothing so that the man who asked how it came there is branded a liar, is unknown in Europe but common in several parts of Africa nad among negroes in America,[7] though in these versions speaking usually means that the skull's interlocutor too is put to death as a liar rather than set a further task of answering riddles. However and wherever the African tale was combined with AT 922, it reached Barra, perhaps with a Hebridean seaman who had sailed on an American ship with negroes in the crew. Certainly it can hardly have been in Barra since Celt and Bantu diverged from a parent stem!

It must not be assumed, either, that while stories stay in the same place they cannot change quite considerably in a short time. I can illustrate this while correcting another error of omission in the same article. I had failed to realise that John Stewart and Andrew Stewart were father and son, so that this 'redaction' was exemplified by versions from a single family's tradtion. In fact similar versions of 'The King and the Miller' have been recorded since from Scots-speaking travellers, among them other members of this family, including Andrew's older brothers Alec and John and Alec's wife Belle Stewart, well-known as a singer. The versions from Alec and Belle[8] show an interesting development of the original text from John Stewart (senior) recorded in his old age in 1955 and now printed in *Tocher* 21:169–71. Alec seems to have made the fundamental changes, turning the king named in the title of his father's version into a more realistic young landlord, and developing his father's suggestion that he 'had a notion of' the miller's daughter: he threatens the miller therefore with eviction (rather than execution) if he cannot answer the three questions. The young shepherd who volunteers to answer them is unknown to the miller's daughter in John's version, where she says, 'I'll marry him if he'll save your life, but not, father, till your life's saved': Andrew makes him into the ubiquitous traveller hero 'Silly Jack', but Alec improves the motivation by making him already the girl's fiancé. Belle's further development consists of making this love interest and the rivalry between landlord and shepherd for the girl's hand the most important part of the story, and the clever solution of the problem which was originally the point of it now becomes a mere appendage to the romance which occupies some three-quarters of her telling.

The creative attitude to storytelling which this exemplifies is typical, alongside a seemingly contradictory respect for a repertoire inherited from their own family and race, of the travelling people (tinkers). Regular readers of this journal will know of the remarkable song repertoire of Scots-speaking travellers and their gifts in interpreting it, and a few fine stories collected from them in the 1950s have appeared here: but it is worth remarking on the enormous increase in the number of tales recorded in the 1970s and still to be recorded from talented traveller storytellers from the edge of the Highlands—Argyll, Perthshire, Angus, Aberdeenshire—like Stanley Robertson,

Bessie Whyte, Duncan Williamson, John Stewart and Willie MacPhee. Some of them have listed literally hundreds of tales they can tell, and have already recorded scores of them, many of them international tale-types previously unknown in Scots or British English. Sometimes there are close resemblances to versions collected by the Brothers Grimm, and there is little doubt that some stories are handed down ultimately from a printed original. Many, perhaps the great majority, of the *Märchen* cannot come from Grimm or Andersen: 'The King and the Miller', for instance, though it resembles a German 'redaction' (Bruford 1973:149), is nothing like the very brief Grimm text where the miller character and the disguise do not appear at all. On the other hand undoubted Andersen stories such as 'The Valiant Tin Soldier' and 'The Tinder-Box' definitely appear in the repertoire of Duncan Williamson. Duncan can normally say without hesitation where he heard a story, and even tell two different versions of a long tale such as AT 461 as he heard it from two different storytellers. He has done very little reading himself, but indicates possible ways in which stories from books could have reached the basically non-literate traveller community: in his own school-days the teacher quite often read aloud stories which Duncan remembered and can tell, and his great-grand-uncle, who was 'reared in the Home School' and could evidently read with some fluency, both read aloud stories from books to his family and other travellers and re-told stories he had read. The Andersen stories, however, come neither from his teacher nor through his father from his great-grand-uncle, but from one of his main sources, 'old Johnnie MacDonald', a cripple who often earned his keep by minding the children of other travellers who were out at work— on farms, hawking or trading—and was thus the nearest thing to a professional oral storyteller to be found in Britain after the Second World War. He himself could neither read nor write, but his exceptionally large repertoire of tales seems to have included many of those which at some time passed into the traveller stock from printed sources.

In this context we may consider some very ancient tales which are still told by travellers. On pages 89–105 in this volume of *Scottish Studies* Sheila Douglas studies a story told by John Stewart (brother of Andrew and Alec mentioned above) which undoubtedly derives from the Old Irish *Immram Máile Dúin*. The details seem to me to point to P. W. Joyce's translation in his *Old Celtic Romances*, published a century before the story was recorded, as the only means by which the story can have reached modern oral tradition, though it is just conceivable that it could have come through Irish from the same source as the only Irish folk version of such a tale known to me—Fr. O'Growney's Modern Irish re-tellings in the *Gaelic Journal* (Bruford 1969:58–9). Even more ancient material appears in Duncan Williamson's repertoire: the stories of Jason and the Golden Fleece, of Midas and of the Minotaur. Bessie Whyte also has recently recorded a story, learned from her mother, whose nameless characters can be identified as Europa—carried off by a bull—and Cadmus—who pursues her with his brothers, is told by an underground voice to follow a cow, kills a dragon and sows its teeth which become men. Bessie's story adds a happy ending to round off the

shapeless origin-myth more satisfactorily with Cadmus finding his sister. Similarly Duncan's Jason, who tends to be called Jack more and more as the story goes on, abandons his classical wanderings for a series of typical *Märchen* adventures. Again, Duncan learned these tales not at school but from Johnnie MacDonald, and a third story from the same source, 'Quicksilver', betrays the common printed source. It is a re-telling of Ovid's tale of Philemon and Baucis, in which the god Mercury appears under the name of Quicksilver, recognisably 'The Miraculous Pitcher' from Nathaniel Hawthorne's *Wonder Book*. Midas ('The Golden Touch') is from the same book, and 'The Minotaur', 'The Golden Fleece', and 'The Dragon's Teeth'—the story of Cadmus, where as in Bessie's story Europa is represented as a little girl and the Delphic oracle as an underground voice like a 'sighing gust of air'—are all in its sequel, *Tanglewood Tales*. The two books appeared in Britain almost simultaneously with the first American editions dated 1852 and 1853, and went through many editions thereafter[9]; again, there has been plenty of time for the stories to pass somehow into traveller oral tradition, and judging by the changes in them they have been there for some time.

Here, therefore, we have been dealing, not with centuries-old oral tradition, but with the receptivity of a lively modern oral tradition to narrative of all sorts, regardless of subject-matter or origin. In fact the Scots traveller storytelling tradition does seem to accept plots but reject names, whether they be Cadmus or Fionn (as in the case of another of Bessie Whyte's stories which probably does have a history of several centuries in oral tradition, but in Gaelic),[10] and this applies also to place-names: this wandering population seldom attaches the same importance to localised legends as those for whom they are part of the history of their own parish, and when they do tell them the scene, unless it is a known camping-ground or gathering-place for travellers, tends to be described in fairly general terms—a place 'on Deeside', or 'in the Isle of Skye', or even 'in the Highlands somewhere'. In fact their repertoire of legends, especially fairy legends, seems to be limited in comparison with their wide range of *Märchen*, 'fairytales' in the other sense, set in a 'Land of Enchantment' with no precise location. *Märchen* have always been difficult to date just because of this imprecision, and the 'historic-geographic' studies of the Finnish School have generally had to rely on the distribution of variants known in writing—indeed for the most part only published variants—rather than internal evidence as a basis for deducing the dates and places where such tales originated. It may be possible in time to decide that in other tales than AT 922 Gaelic versions are related through Ireland to France and Scots ones to Germany or England; if so this would suggest that they came to Scotland in the later Middle Ages, when there were regular trade relations in these directions, though the Scots tales could have arrived later than this by the East Coast route, or the Gaelic ones with returning Jacobites! There is no literary evidence for the existence of any recognisable complete *Märchen* in Scotland before 1600, though at least one (AT 910B, 'The Three Wise Counsels') was used as the basis of

the greater part of the 'Irish Odyssey', *Merugud Uilix meic Leirtis,* in Ireland about the twelfth century. This in itself does not prove that there were not *Märchen* known in Scotland much earlier; and there is no reason to discount the possibility that some *Märchen* types may have travelled from a birthplace in Ireland or even Scotland to France rather than *vice versa*, particularly in cases such as AT 709 (Snow White) or AT 303 (The Twins) (see Appendix A, p. 55). But the *Märchen* as we now know it in Europe seems to be mainly the creation of the later Middle Ages, and this is as true in Scotland as anywhere else.

My study of native Gaelic hero-tales, generally like *Märchen* in their conventions except that the characters are given names, showed that it was possible for such a tale to become as popular, and as much varied, as all but the half-dozen commonest *Märchen* in Ireland or Gaelic Scotland, when there is no reason to doubt that it was originally a literary composition of the sixteenth or seventeenth century. Though tales whose original form can be dated seven or eight centuries earlier do turn up, they generally do so in the shape in which they were still being copied, by Scottish scribes in many cases, in post-mediaeval paper manuscripts, and are most likely to have reached oral tradition by being read aloud from such manuscripts: the Ulster cycle tales which have become folktales in Scotland, even the *Táin,* are in paper manuscripts, apart from the part of the Deirdre story which tells of Deirdre's birth (Bruford 1969:93, 103–4), and since the only complete version of that tale from Scotland (Carmichael 1914) is not free from editorial interference,[11] it may be safer not to build too much on that point.

However, it was with a legend that this argument began, and it is time to come back to the question of dating those tales which are normally linked with real places and people of some significance to the teller. Unfortunately legends are if anything less likely to be attested in mediaeval writings than *Märchen*, and any attempt to date them must rely mainly on internal evidence or distribution patterns. The persistence of Old Irish patterns of thought, at least, is more marked in Scottish Gaelic historical legends, which for the most part are tied firmly to local heroes and events of—again—the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, than in the more fantastic hero-tales. Certainly the ideas concerned were also contained in stories being copied by Scottish scribes about the time that the events to which they became attached were enacted, and must have been known to the professional *seanchaidhs* who surely helped to shape the legends of their clans; but in this case I feel that what was passed on was not merely a literary cliché but a way of thinking, principally an idea of the hero which was important enough to transcend mere fact. The proportion of truth to recurrent fiction in Gaelic historical legends deserves a separate and exhaustive study: here I want to quote only a couple of examples of which I mean.[12] Von Hahn's 'Aryan Expulsion-and-Return Formula', used of numerous semi-mythical Irish kings such as Labraid Loingsech and Lugaid macCon, is so firmly entrenched in the Gaelic consciousness that it can be applied to any excluded heir: in an extreme case to a middle-

aged chief of Lochbuie, kept out of his lands for a year or so by an uncle, who is metamorphosed according to a tradition still well-known in Mull into a child born to a father already imprisoned by a rival chief, smuggled into hiding and eventually overseas, to return twenty years later with a following of Irish swordsmen and recapture his castle (*Tocher*; 24:292–7; MacCormick 1923:92–102). A more exclusively Gaelic development of the motif of the Fated Death, where a hero such as Cú Chulainn or Conaire Mór meets his death as the immediate and inevitable consequence of breaking a personal taboo (*geis*) or a series of such taboos, also persists. The best-known instance is the legend of Eoghan a' Chinn Bhig, warned by a *bean-nighe* that he would die in next day's battle unless his niggardly wife put butter on the table without being asked for it: this is told of others too, including the last of the MacCrimmons.[13] (The inconsequential nature of the taboo, its concern with food and perhaps the difficulty of avoiding it—since either asking or not asking and not getting would be a breach—are typical of the older tradition, but its announcement at the last moment is a modern development.) More impressive is the series of three prohibitions given by a witch to Sir Lachlan MacLean of Duart before his death at the Battle of Gruinart in 1598: one, not to circle a knoll or island widdershins, broken in deliberate defiance; another, not to land on Thursday, broken by the accident of a sudden storm; and the last, not to drink from the well of Niall Neònach, broken in ignorance of the name—followed at once by the prophesied death as he stooped to drink at the well. Not only is this tradition still well known in Islay, but it is mentioned in an almost contemporary manuscript source which includes the two latter taboos.[14]

Supernatural legends are a much more diverse body. While there is little quite like the Gaelic clan legends in Scots, even in the clan ballads of the North-East, migratory legends of the supernatural seem to cross linguistic boundaries even more easily than *Märchen*, and many if not most of them can be found in both languages of Scotland. The movement may have been from Scots to Gaelic as often as Gaelic to Scots: many witch legends must have spread with the witch persecutions from the Lowlands, and the half-jocular stories have persisted while the beliefs involved never took root like the older beliefs in the Evil Eye and the taking of profit. English words in a Gaelic narration, or at least a Lowland-style social background to the story, demonstrate this in two cases (Bruford 1967:14–15). In other cases (Bruford 1967:22 (Type 6), 24 (Type 8), 31 (Type 31)) the story involves very ancient motifs, none of them specifically 'Celtic' but capable of being paralleled throughout Europe. The first case, the girdle placed on a standing stone or bush instead of a person whom it would have killed, is certainly reminiscent of Balor's head in *Cath Maige Tured*, as I suggested, but there are actually closer parallels involving a girdle presented by a supernatural being and put round a tree in German tales:[15] I cannot point to a classical original but it would not be surprising if one appeared. In the other two cases there are certainly variants to show how the Scottish legends are linked in time and space with their

Greek or Latin prototypes: Child's notes to his Type 6 are sufficient to illustrate how widespread tales of childbirth delayed by magic are, while the three knots raising the wind are attested in a similar form—a development of the prototype in the *Odyssey*—at least from the Baltic to Ireland.[16] One of the most popular witch legends seems to have been extracted from a *Märchen* which the authoritative study (Ranke 1934:376–7) considers too complex in its developed form to be very old, by implication put together at least since AD 1000—but it is conceivable (see Appendix A) that the Scottish legend is actually one of the sources of the international tale.

However, if we are looking for legends which might be expected to have survived for a thousand years or more in the same place, we must surely look among the legends of fairies and other supernatural beings. This is the category to which, for convenience, I would assign the legend of the piper with which we began (though in fact in many versions fairies or supernatural beings of any sort make no overt appearance). Moreover, nobody with a knowledge of Gaelic storytelling can deny that there is a continuous development of the fairies (*sìdhichean, daoine sìdhe*) from the Tuatha Dé Danann (*aes síde*) of early Irish literature, who are simply the gods of pagan Ireland as represented by Christian writers—as a conquered race of human beings with manifestly superhuman powers. At the same time they are not a specifically Gaelic concept, and in fact most of the nations and tribes of mankind, including those who have never given up their pagan gods, seem to have, or once to have had, a belief in beings, of whatever stature or appearance, who hover like the fairies of recent times on the fringes of official belief and function in the same way as representatives of wild nature, sometimes helpful, sometimes frightening, most often serving as scapegoats when something inexplicably goes wrong (*cf.* MacDougall 1978:ix). So the legends are often migratory and even international. In fact there seems to have been disappointingly little investigation of the international parallels to British fairy legends—at least published in English—since Thomas Keightley brought many of them to light in his *Fairy Mythology* over 150 years ago. Apart from the two types so widespread that they are catalogued as *Märchen* (AT 500 (Rumpelstiltskin) and AT 503, the story of the two hunchbacks) and the universal trick where the fairy's opponent gives his or her name as 'Myself' (motif K602), Keightley gives evidence of the distribution throughout Europe of such legends as that of the fairy midwife; the changeling detected by pretending to brew in eggshells; the brownie 'paid off' with clothing or moving house along with the family who are trying to get away from him; the theft of a fairy cup; the final departure of the fairies, and so on.[17] Recent catalogues add a few, such as the fairy coming to complain of a mortal's drain emptying into his house or the like (Christiansen 1958:No. 5075; Simonsuuri 1961 No. M 76, M 342), but close parallels to Scottish types seem rather few.

One relevant feature of the distribution of fairy legends in the British Isles is the situation in Orkney and Shetland. It is now thought that the Norsemen who settled the islands from the ninth century onwards did not wipe out the native 'Pictish'

inhabitants (though their language disappeared almost without trace) and possibly even intermarried with them. Any influx of population since the later Middle Ages has been from mainland Scotland, and the modern dialect is basically Scots, though including many Norse words, especially in Shetland, where trade with Norway for boat-timbers and other wooden objects was regular in the last century, and close contacts at least with Norse fishermen continued into this. Out of Christiansen's catalogue (Christiansen 1958), which presumably includes all the important recurrent legend types dealing with fairies (*huldre*) in Norway, if we disregard the types already mentioned which seem to be common to a great part of Europe at least, there seem only to be two which can be recognised in Orkney and Shetland but not elsewhere in Scotland, and may therefore go back to the fifteenth century or earlier, when the islands were still a Norse dependency. One of these, Type 6000, 'Tricking the Fairy Suitor', is only known to me from a single variant I recorded in South Ronaldsay, the nearest of the islands to the Scottish mainland (*Tocher* 26:100–1). I have pointed out elsewhere (Bruford 1979:156) that this story, where the fairy suitor's advice on protecting a cow from a fairy bull is applied to the girl he is courting, is virtually a reversal of the way in which in other Scottish tales the lover's charm is misdirected so that a cow or the like falls in love with him; and indeed have found a Gaelic tale since which parallels the Norwegian type almost as closely in a different way.[18] The second case is less doubtful: type 6070A, 'Fairies send a Message', is known in Fetlar and was known in Foula in a form whose very words, at least in the message itself, still include Norse names for fairies and were once almost completely in the older Norse speech of Shetland. But even here the issue is clouded by resemblances to Gaelic legends on the one side and the existence of a parallel local, non-migratory 'memorate' on the other (Bruford 1979:159–60). We can discount the parallels to Type 3080, 'The Finn Messenger', where in Shetland versions (*e.g.* Nelson 1971) the 'Finn man' or 'Norway Finn' is clearly a Lappish magician as in the Norwegian ones, not one of the sea-fairies with whom the Lapps, because they could turn into seals, sometimes became confused. Nearly all the other fairy legends of the Northern Isles can more easily be paralleled in Gaelic Scotland.[19]

Even what is generally felt to be a typical Nordic legend—the story of the man who captures a seal-woman's skin and marries her until many years later she finds the skin and goes back to the sea—is not Norwegian and may well be Irish in origin. It is well-known round most of the coasts of Ireland and Scotland—alternating with a form where a mermaid and her 'slough' (Gaelic *cochull*, meaning apparently a scaly tail which comes off to reveal human legs) replace the seal and her skin—common in Orkney and Shetland, known in Iceland and the Faeroes, but although assigned a number (4080) by Christiansen (1958:75), he can only quote one Norwegian version.[20] The Northern Isles are more likely to be a staging-post on a journey from West to East, in this legend's case, than on one from East to West: possibly, but not probably, they are the centre from which the story spread in all directions and where

it was invented, or rather adapted from the international motif of the swan-maiden (D361.1) which in that form is known from Greenland to Polynesia and must be the primary form. But leaving aside the possibility that one or two Shetland or Orkney legends might be home-grown products, why are more of them paralleled in the Highlands than in Norway? The romantic may be tempted to see this as meaning that the Picts handed on their legends, though not their language, to Gaelic-speaking and Norse-speaking invaders alike. There is some support for this in a general impression, which I cannot yet fully substantiate, that a good many Northern Scottish fairy legend types are unknown or at least uncommon in Ireland (and *vice versa*), and that some of them may be easier to parallel from England or Wales, as well as Lowland Scotland, regions where the population of 1500 years ago were speakers of P-Celtic like the Picts. (The story of the piper in the cave, incidentally, is a notable example.) A more sober interpretation of the evidence may be that the Highlanders have been accumulating legends over the past millennium from many sources—Irish, English and others —and no doubt inventing some themselves; and that since the fifteenth century the settlers and fugitives who have made names like Tulloch and Fraser, Mackay and Leask common in the Northern Isles, along with visiting merchants and fishermen, have carried the legends on to take root again there. The fact that the term for a fairy in the North Isles is 'trow' (from the Norse *troll*) in most districts, the English or Scots 'fairy' in others, along with some synonyms such as 'hill-folk', but never anything related to the modern Norse term *huldre*,[21] certainly suggests that Norse concepts of the fairies have become confused with the passage of time and overlaid with Scottish ideas, and the stories surely cling to the beliefs.

Let us conclude by looking more closely at one legend with a distribution pattern of this sort, regularly associated with existing 'sites' and closely related to the story of the piper, since it also concerns the disappearance of a mortal, in some versions a musician, into the fairy hill. I have never come across an Irish version, though it looks like a story which might easily fit into the Irish tradition, and has features in common with an international type, AT 471A 'The Monk and the Bird', generally thought to be of Irish origin; but it is not in some major collections or the only available catalogue,[22] and indeed if it were associated with 'fairy hills' in Ireland as it is in the Highlands enough of them would surely be 'Lughnasa sites' for it to be in Máire MacNeill's book somewhere. The story is normally about two men going for whisky to celebrate New Year (or a christening) who see the fairy hill with its door open, lights blazing and music playing: one is tempted in and joins the dance, the other stays outside and the door closes. A year later he goes back, finds the door open once more and drags out his companion, who is convinced he has hardly finished the first reel he was dancing, and that with the full cask or jar of whisky strapped on his back; but the state of his boots, or the fact that the child who was to be christened is now walking, may help to change his mind. Versions are known at least from Easter and Wester Ross, several parts of Inverness-shire, Lorne and almost every parish of Highland

Perthshire, from the islands of Lewis, Harris, Benbecula and South Uist, Barra, Skye, Raasay, Iona and Islay, the mainlands of Orkney and Shetland, and Yell.[23] In some versions the men are described as fiddlers or pipers, and Shetland versions may be conflated with a separate legend of a fiddler invited to play for a fairy wedding (and not kept for long: *Tocher* 28:202–3): in Shetland and Iona a basket or string of fish may replace the whisky (but in Iona the fish rots, in Shetland it is still fresh after a year!). Occasionally, too, the dancer comes out of his own accord not after one year but a hundred: Orcadians claim that the original idea for Rip Van Winkle came from a version of this story told to Washington Irving by his parents, who were born in Shapinsay.

Many versions of this legend—probably all the older ones—are associated with the *sìdhean* or fairy hill of the locality: this may be a natural hill or knoll, a prehistoric chamber tomb or tumulus, or even (as in the best-known Orkney example, which prefers it to a multitude of chambered cairns in the neighbourhood) the grass-grown ruins of an Iron-Age broch. With the possible exception of the last type it seems quite likely that these sites have been sacred places since pre-Christian times, and if the legend has a long association with each one of them it must be old indeed. The lack or at least rarity of Irish parallels suggests that it could have been in the Highlands before the Gaels arrived there. There are apparently no Lowland versions, perhaps because there are not recognised fairy hills of the same sort in the Lowland regions. In fact, however, the closest parallels outside Scotland lack the element of the fairy hill. There are a number of versions from Wales[24] very like the Scottish legends except that the dancer carries no load of whisky or fish, and does not go into a hill because the dance takes place out of doors in a fairy ring, and the dancers simply vanish for a year. So have we a very ancient British or P-Celtic legend here from before the English came? Or since the motif of the supernatural lapse of time in the Otherworld, which is the basis of the story, is much more widespread, should we not wait and see if there are versions outside these islands again? Keightley (1850:124–5) certainly prints something very like our legend from Denmark: if it is at all common there we may have to concede that this legend too, like most other migratory types, could have travelled within Scotland or even arrived in Scotland within the past millennium.

APPENDIX A

Even now too few of the Irish and Scottish Gaelic tales, collected in their thousands over the past 120 years, have been published in translation to be sufficiently taken into account in comparative studies, and while the Indian end of the area which Stith Thompson defined as 'From Ireland to India' (Thompson 1946, title to Part Two) is acknowledged as the birthplace of some, if no longer all, *Märchen* types, the Gaels have to be content with the occasional fumble by an Arthurian scholar looking for 'Celtic' motifs. But if French romances used material which may have come from Ireland or even Pictland, why not the many *Märchen* whose first recorded appearance may be in French? Certainly if Snow-White's stepmother

consults a trout in a well rather than a mirror on a wall (Bruford 1965*b*: 154, 162–5, 172–3) it is both a less modern concept and one deeply rooted in Gaelic lore, and indeed in traditional practice, since a trout, eel or other fish was regularly kept in wells to purify drinking water in various parts of the British Isles until recent times: the burden of proof would be on those who wished to show that this Gaelic form of the motif was *not* the original one. In 'The Twins', assigned tentatively to a mediaeval French origin (Ranke 1934: 374–7), the argument is less certain: since the witch part of the story is well established in Scotland as a local legend (Bruford 1967: 18), it seems unlikely to derive from a story which reached Scotland late. It can hardly be the original form, since the hero who is told to bind his hounds with a hair, and deliberately does not, needs the contrast of the brother who obeyed and was destroyed to bring out the point of the request. But among both Scots and Gaelic-speaking travellers especially, this episode, following immediately from the miraculous birth and upbringing of the twins without the intervening dragon-slaying sequence of the standard international type, is regularly told as a separate story, even by narrators who also know the dragon-slayer type (AT 300). The stories are known separately in other countries, but they perhaps do not occur so regularly, and it seems just possible that the witch-and-twins tale already existed in Scotland before it was put together with the dragon-slayer type (in Scotland or nearby) by the compiler who most probably created AT 303.

NOTES

1 See below and note 3. I owe to Stephen Miller, a student in Oral Literature and Popular Tradition 1, a reference to an unusually detailed version from the parish of Cairnie in Aberdeenshire, where a piper, his daughter and a cow all vanished into a cave on the Binn Hill known as the Elf-House (Pirie 1906: 134–5): Mr Miller has heard this in local oral tradition. There are also likely to be versions in the Archives of the School of Scottish Studies as yet unindexed. I do not intend to say anything about the 'B versions', at least those which deal just with an attempt to recover treasure, since they are relevant only to the supposed Lughnasa myth and not to the tale of the piper; moreover they are too few to be of much help to students of the vast field of traditions about treasures.

2 Such a myth seems fundamentally unconvincing. If the piper represents the god, or demigod, Lugh (Melia 1967: 371) he should emerge triumphant after harrowing the underworld, not vanish forever —and in any case, the idea that myths derive from vanished rituals is surely long since discredited. The usual pattern of raids on the gods in known mythologies either follows the type in which fire is stolen from heaven, or—more relevant here—the attempt, generally unsuccessful, to free a mortal from the nether world. (Early Irish tales in fact mention the *successful* recapture of women such as Étaín, and sometimes of other booty, from the *síd* or otherworld simply by digging into the fairy hill.) Neither of these provides any parallel to the usual form of the legend, and it seems very possible that the mention of treasure in the Teltown story was inspired more by tales of actual hoards dug up at ancient sites than anything to do with 'fairy gold' (which in any case notoriously turns into leaves or dung in daylight). In fact there seems to be nothing but the bare name of the 'Cave of Gold' to suggest that a quest for treasure is involved in any of the Scottish versions of our story—the cave is explored simply 'because it is there' (but see note 5).

3 The Kintyre story includes the rhyme 'I doubt, I doubt/I'll ne'er get out' in English. The source of the tunnel from Glasgow Cathedral to Rutherglen, dug by the Picts coming to build the cathedral (!), is given as Hugh MacDonald's 'ramble' *Rutherglen and Cathkin*.

4 The usual story of the cave of Weem, as given by Mackay 1954: 207–8 and 182, concerns two stepsisters, one of whom went into the cave in search of a lost calf, was captured behind the nine gates and eventually found dead in Loch Glassie. References to versions of this from printed sources and Lady Evelyn Stewart-Murray's manuscripts will be found in *Tocher* 33: 211–12 (explaining the version of the associated song printed in *Tocher* 27: 178–9). I am grateful to Dr Buchan for drawing

my attention to the printed sources. The better-known piper tale was probably substituted in this case when the details of the original story began to be forgotten.

5 The story, heard by Mrs Dix's father when apprenticed to a tailor on Loch Long-side, was that a sobbing sound used to be heard on dark nights from a cave in the hills near there, which was therefore called Uamh na h-Ochanaich (The Cave of the Sobbing). At last a local lad ventured to go there for a wager and discovered that close to, the sobbing sounded like sweet music: it was made by an old fairy man sitting in the mouth of the cave playing a 'Lochaber Jews' harp' (*tromb Abrach*) to frighten away intruders while his companions held their revels further in. When this was discovered the able-bodied young men of the community all gathered to raid the cave for the fairies' money (or silver—*airgiod*) but were never seen again.

6 So in the Mull version (MacCormick 1923: 79–81) and the sources cited by Buchan 1979: 36 from Wester Ross, Colonsay and Arran at least. In other cases the dog may be remembered but the reason for his presence forgotten, and he comes out the way he came in: only in Buchan's *Kin 1* is his howling heard from above like the lowing of the Cairnie cow (note 1). The dog emerging hairless is a feature of other Gaelic stories, where for instance Fionn and Bran his dog go inside a monster to kill it (*e.g.* MacLellan 1961: 11). This could be rationalised as a result of entering the monster's digestive juices, and the parallel with emergence from a cave is obvious; but in fact dogs return hairless from other violent encounters with the supernatural, as in witch type 3 (Bruford 1967: 19).

7 Dorson 1967: 146–8 gives three American variants and references to others in America and Africa: one of his versions is a similar combination with a well-known international type, AT 1791. I cannot easily refer to a catalogue of African types, but have heard several oral re-tellings: one by Dr Roy Willis, giving the Scottish Oral History Group an example of tales he had collected among the Fipa of Tanzania, first drew my attention to the wanderings of the type.

8 Alec Stewart's recent and much mourned death, preceded by several years of serious illness, has meant that his excellent storytelling has been little recorded when he was at his best. Some cassette recordings have been made recently by Mrs Sheila Douglas, and in the sixties by Maurice Fleming (unfortunately erased after transcription), and I am grateful to Mr Fleming for a transcription of 'The King and the Miller'. I recorded Belle telling the story, the first she volunteered when asked if she could tell any stories, in Edinburgh in November 1977 (SA 1977/161 A1).

9 Hawthorne 1972: 375–6, 384–5 (British editions); see *op. cit.*: 40, 118, 183, 234, 330 for the tales cited.

10 'The Princess and the Pups' (*Tocher* 23: 258–61) is a version without names of the 'Finding of Bran' episode of the Fenian romance *Feis Tighe Chonáin*, a late mediaeval literary use of the folk motif of the wonderful helpers, which has returned to the folk realm and seems to be catalogued by O Súilleabháin and Christiansen (1963: 135) simply under the international type AT 653; see also Bruford 1969: 118 and note. It was in fact a request to tell this story, which Bessie had half-forgotten since first recording it, that led to the recording of another story about an abducted princess, her Cadmus story (SA 1980/41 A).

11 The title for a start seems to be Carmichael's own invention, and with it goes Carmichael's note that 'the form Deirdire seems to be confined to the tale, and the form Dearduil to the poems on the lady' (Carmichael 1914: 135). Both forms are used in poems and prose introductions printed in *Leabhar na Féinne* (Campbell 1872: 19–29). In fact the fair copy of the story as Carmichael took it down (Edinburgh University Library, Carmichael-Watson MS 154: 4–29) calls her Dearduil except for the portion of the story from her elopement to her return to Ireland, where for some reason she becomes Deairdire. As in the majority of folk versions, the story is not called by her name (*cf.* Bruford 1969: 103), but is 'Eachdraidh Chlann Uisne'. Naoise is Naoisne throughout (assimilated to his patronymic); Deirdre's father is Golam, not Colum, Cruitire; and the editor has apparently changed Loch Ness to Loch Etive on the strength of Argyll tradition and supplied names for the three sons of Fergus (Fearchar) from the written romance. This is not the place for the full comparison which should be made: but the text has been expanded and rewritten throughout, and the entire discussion with Fergus, Deirdre's dream—suggested no doubt by the lay—and the two very strange-looking poems (Carmichael 1914: 62–75) have been interpolated where the manuscript has five sentences of dialogue and narration.

12 These have been cited in unpublished papers I have read at two International Congresses of Celtic Studies, at Edinburgh in 1967 and Galway in 1979, and I have often used them in lectures, but the subject deserves extended treatment in print.

13 The fullest account in print is perhaps that in Campbell 1902:115–17 (the footnote at the end refers to the other Lochbuie story just mentioned). The MacCrimmon tale, which predictably makes Domhnall Bàn a volunteer on the Jacobite side, not part of a Government levy (*cf.* Blankenhorn 1978:46), was recorded by the late Dr Calum Maclean for the Irish Folklore Commission in Skye (reference mislaid).

14 Recent traditions have been recorded but not printed, apart from two private productions of very full accounts of the Battle of Gruinart: (English translation only) School of Scottish Studies teaching booklet, *Scottish Traditional Tales* (1974): 143–5; (Gaelic only) an anonymous publication from the Dewar MSS, presumably the few copies in the National Library of Scotland among the Campbell of Islay MSS, headed: *Ian Og Ile/, MS. VII, Ian Deoir/ Earrann 1/ Blar Traigh/ Ghruinneaird* (John Grant, Edinburgh 1950). The contemporary account—probably by Sir Robert Gordon, but I have not established whether this manuscript of 'Feuds and Conflicts of the Clans' is simply taken from his History of Sutherland or is a parallel source—is published by MacGregor 1907:134–5 (who also refers to a publication in vol. XI of the *Celtic Magazine*): 'Maclean had three responses from a witch before he undertook this journey into Isla; first, desiring him not to land there upon Thursday; the next was, forbidding him to drink of a well beside Gruinart; and thirdly, she told him that one called Maclean should be slain at Gruinart. The first he transgressed unwillingly, being driven into that island by a tempest on a Thursday. The second he transgressed negligently, and drank of that water before he knew the name of the place, and so he died at Gruinart, as was foretold him, but doubtfully, and as commonly all such responses be.'

15 Mackensen 1934–40:675, *s.v. gürtel*, refers to the girdle bringing death or destruction, given by a forest fairy (*Waldfee*) or giants, which as a precaution is first placed round a young tree, as a motif more typical of *Sage* or legend but presumably also found in Märchen. See *Tocher* 28:206–7 (*cf.* note 18) for a further Scottish version where it is a fairy who gives the girdle and, as in the Old Irish tale, a stone and not a tree round which it is put—but in the treeless Hebrides this is hardly surprising!

16 See Hole 1957:132 for a reference to this tale, as fact, of the Isle of Man, from Higden's *Polychronicon* (and *op. cit.*:128 for a more general discussion of the motif, unfortunately with few sources cited). The only Irish version I have come across (Ó hEochaidh 1954:209–10) is about a breeze raised to cool peat-workers, but no doubt more typical versions can be found. For Danish versions see, for instance, Kristensen 1901:414–16, Nos. 1220, 1222–4, and for Finnish ones see Taylor 1927:42 and n.3—who refers to the story as a 'medieval tradition'. I should add that non-Gaelic versions from Northern Scotland are common in fact (*cf.* Bruford 1967:31).

17 The following page numbers and nationalities are those of examples of the legends mentioned in the enlarged 'new edition' of Keightley's book (1850). AT 500: 116, 232 (Danish, German); AT 503: 364, 439, 461 (Irish, Breton, Spanish); 'Myself': 313, 396, 477, 489 (English, Scottish Gaelic, French); midwife to the fairies: 122, 261, 275, 301, 311, 353, 388, 506 (Swedish, German, three English, Lowland Scots, and a Jewish parallel told of a male circumciser); eggshells: 126 note, 365, 436, 473 (German, Scots, Irish, Breton, French; also imperfect parallels 125, 416, Danish and Welsh); 'paid off' (*ausgelohnt*): 229, 296, 358, 395 (German, English, Scots, Gaelic); 'we're flitting': 140, 307, 369, 491 (Danish, with mention of German parallel, English, Irish, Polish); cup: 88, 109, 237, 283, 284, 399 (2 Danish, German, 2 English, Manx); fairies depart: 127, 224 ff., 257, 273, 356 (Danish, several German, Swiss, Scottish). Other seemingly widespread types are the story of the wish for fairy food or drink (Christiansen 1958 type 5080; Keightley 1850:352); and the story of the knife thrown at an animal or whirlwind and later found in a fairy (or Lappish) dwelling (Simonsuuri 1961 type D 1101 ff.; *cf.* Taylor 1927:25).

18 *Tocher* 28:204–7—another case of the charm to delay childbirth mentioned above, caused by a jealous fairy lover not a witch, replaces the love charm, but the cure as in the Norwegian tale is by a herb, pearlwort (*mungan*). For the 'reverse' cases, involving love charms used both by mortals and by fairies, see *Tocher* 1:11–13 and 20:128–9.

19 I am indebted to my colleague D. A. MacDonald for drawing my attention to a legend from the *Western* Isles which, exceptionally, may have survived there since Norse times. The story of a bull 'Tarbh na Leòid' (not *Mac*Leod's bull, though modern storytellers may interpret it this way, but perhaps Ljót's bull?) which fights a water-horse to the death is widely known in North Uist. It is set at a loch in the island of Heisker called Loch Snigreabhad, which Mr MacDonald suggests probably derives from Old Norse **nykra-vatn*, 'loch of the water-horse'. This does not of course prove that this story was known there from Norse times, but there is a partial resemblance to Christiansen's Type 4085, 'The Seahorse and the Seaserpent' (Christiansen 1958:75–7), which is not otherwise paralleled in Scotland.

20 For the Irish distribution my evidence is oral information from Professor Bo Almqvist on the results of a survey of material in the archives of the Department of Irish Folklore, University College, Dublin, by students under his direction; these have not to my knowledge been published. For Scottish evidence I rely on the Central Index of the School of Scottish Studies and my own fieldwork. There may be more Danish versions than Norwegian: the only one I can cite at the moment is one referred to by Christiansen, Kristensen 1893:148, No. 16, a very brief summary.

21 It has sometimes been claimed that trows and fairies in the Northern Isles were identical, but there seem to have been memories that trows were a coarser breed: see Marwick 1975:32–46, and Tom Tulloch in *Tocher* 30:370. As the latter says both terms were known in Yell (and possibly the other North Isles of Shetland), 'fairies' being the commoner, 'trows' a more earthy type of being. In South Ronaldsay, James Henderson (*Tocher* 26:102) felt that 'trows' was the older term, but 'fairies' or 'fairags' was the usual one by the time of his youth (born 1903). The latter form borrows an ending from Gaelic which is originally feminine, though in the South Isles and East Mainland of Orkney diminutives in -ag or -ock can apply to either sex, and in fact seems to be collective or feminine, since a male fairy was called an elf. It may be in fact that the modern Norse term *huldre*(*-folk*), meaning 'hidden (people)', has only replaced forms such as *alver*, 'elves', as the general term for fairies since regular comings and goings to Orkney ceased; this probably *has* happened since the Northern Isles were first settled, though the late Ernest Marwick suggested that there might be a trace of the usage in the place-name Hildival and a once-noted compound 'hilderbogie' (Marwick 1972:198). So it is possible that 'trow' was adapted in Orkney and Shetland at the same time as *hulder* was being adopted for the same purpose in Norway and 'fairy' was being brought in by the Scots settlers.

22 Ó Súilleabháin 1942:450–70 has two slightly relevant entries among hundreds: 'two men who enter a room under a hill where a dance is being held wake up in the open next day' (p. 470) and 'woman who spent two days dancing in a fairy place thought she had been there only a few minutes' (p. 466), but the time-scale at least is hardly the same. One of the most comprehensive modern collections of Irish fairy legends (Ó hEochaidh 1954: the enlarged new edition with translation, Dublin 1977, was not available to me) has no trace of it. Keightley 1850:125 n., under a Danish parallel, refers to 'the Irish legend of Clough na Cuddy, so extremely well told by Mr. C. Croker', but I cannot trace this in Croker 1888, which is said to include all but the Welsh and German matter in the third volume of the rare first edition.

23 Some printed versions are in Grant Stewart 1823:91–102; Campbell 1900:61–3 (including the Iona version cited); MacDougall 1978:28–30; Mackenzie 1914:266–7; as well as journals such as *Folk-Lore* (11:442–3); *The Celtic Review* (5:169) and *Transactions of the Gaelic Society of Inverness* (29:272–4) which certainly include other versions that I cannot now cite.

24 See, for instance, Keightley 1850:415–6 (abridged from Croker's third volume referred to in note 22); Sikes 1880:70–9; Owen 1896:36–44 (each of these with four versions: the total, allowing for overlaps, is seven).

REFERENCES

References to AT are to type-numbes in Antti Aarne and Stith Thompson, *The Types of the Folktale*, FF Communications No. 184, Helsinki 1964. References beginning with a single capital letter (*e.g.* D361.1) are to motifs in Stith Thompson, *A Motif-Index of Folk-Literature* (Copenhagen 1955–8).

BLANKENHORN, V. S.
1978 'Traditional and Bogus Elements in "MacCrimmon's Lament".' *Scottish Studies* 22:45–67. Edinburgh.

BRUFORD, ALAN
1965*a* 'Eachtra Chonaill Gulban.' *Béaloideas* 31:1–50. Dublin.
1965*b* 'A Scottish Gaelic Version of "Snow-White".' *Scottish Studies* 9:153–74. Edinburgh.
1967 'Scottish Gaelic Witch Stories: A Provisional Type-List.' *Scottish Studies* 11:13–47. Edinburgh.
1969 *Gaelic Folk-Tales and Mediaeval Romances.* Dublin.
1973 '"The King's Three Questions" (AT 922) in Scotland.' *Scottish Studies* 17:147–54. Edinburgh.
1979 'Problems in Cataloguing Scottish Supernatural and Historical Legends.' *Journal of the Folklore Institute.* Bloomington.

BUCHAN, DAVID
1979 'The Legend of the Lughnasa Musician in Lowland Britain.' *Scottish Studies* 23:15–37. Edinburgh.

CAMPBELL, J. F.
1872 *Leabhar na Féinne.* London.

CAMPBELL, J. G.
1900 *Superstitions of the Scottish Highlands.* Glasgow.
1902 *Witchcraft and Second Sight in the Scottish Highlands.* Glasgow.

CARMICHAEL, ALEXANDER
1914 *Deirdire.* Second edn. Paisley.

CHRISTIANSEN, R. Th.
1958 *The Migratory Legends.* FF Communications No. 175. Helsinki.

CROKER, T. CROFTON
1888 *Fairy Legends and Traditions of the South of Ireland.* New edn. London.

DORSON, R. M.
1967 *American Negro Folktales.* New York.

GRANT STEWART, W.
1823 *The Popular Superstitions and Festive Amusements of the Highlanders of Scotland.* Edinburgh.

HAWTHORNE, NATHANIEL
1972 *A Wonder Book* and *Tanglewood Tales.* Centenary edn. vol. VII. Ohio.

HOLE, CHRISTINA
1957 *A Mirror of Witchcraft.* London.

JACOBS, JOSEPH
1894 *More English Fairy Tales.* London.

KEIGHTLEY, THOMAS
1850 *The Fairy Mythology.* New edn. London.

KRISTENSEN, E. T.
1893 *Danske Sagn* II. Aarhus.
1901 *Danske Sagn* VI. Aarhus.

MACCORMICK, JOHN
1923 *The Island of Mull.* Glasgow.

MACDONALD, K. N.
1901 *Puirt-a-Beul.* Glasgow.

MACDOUGALL, JAMES
1978 *Highland Fairy Legends*, ed. Alan Bruford. Ipswich.
MACGREGOR, ALEXANDER
1907 *The Feuds of the Clans*. Stirling.
MACGREGOR, A. A.
1947 *The Peat Fire Flame*. Edinburgh.
MACKAY, N. D.
1954 *Aberfeldy Past and Present*. Coupar Angus.
MACKENSEN, LUTZ (ed.)
1934–40 *Handwörterbuch des deutschen Märchens* II. Berlin.
MACKENZIE, W. M.
1914 *The Book of Arran* vol. II. Glasgow.
MACLELLAN, ANGUS
1961 *Stories from South Uist*. Translated by J. L. Campbell. London.
MACNEILL, MÁIRE
1962 *The Festival of Lughnasa*. London.
MANSON, W. L.
1901 *The Highland Bagpipe*. Paisley.
MARTIN, MARTIN
1934 *A Description of the Western Islands of Scotland, circa 1695*. Stirling.
MARWICK, ERNEST W.
1972 'Creatures of Orkney Legend and their Norse Ancestry.' *Norveg* 15:177–204. Oslo.
1975 *The Folklore of Orkney and Shetland*. London.
MELIA, DANIEL F.
1967 'The Lughnasa Musician in Ireland and Scotland.' *Journal of American Folklore* 80:365–73. Austin.
NELSON, GEORGE
1971 'Atlantic Message.' *Shetland Folk Book* 5:1–3.
Ó HEOCHAIDH, SEÁN
1954 'Sídhe-Scéalta.' *Béaloideas* 23:135–229. Dublin.
Ó SÚILLEABHÁIN, SEÁN
1942 *A Handbook of Irish Folklore*. Dublin.
Ó SÚILLEABHÁIN, SEÁN and CHRISTIANSEN, R. Th.
1963 *The Types of the Irish Folktale*. FF Communications No. 188. Helsinki.
OWEN, ELIAS
1896 *Welsh Folk-Lore: A Collection of the Folk-Tales and Legends of North Wales*. Oswestry and Wrexham. (n.d.)
PIRIE, JAMES
1906 *The Parish of Cairnie*. Banff.
RANKE, KURT
1934 *Die Zwei Brüder*. FF Communications No. 114. Helsinki.
SA
Sound-recording Archive, School of Scottish Studies, University of Edinburgh: main chronological series of original tapes.
SAXBY, J. M. E.
1932 *Shetland Traditional Lore*. Edinburgh.
SIKES, WIRT
1880 *British Goblins*. London.
SIMONSUURI, LAURI
1961 *Typen-und Motivverzeichnis der finnischen mythischen Sagen*. FF Communications No. 182. Helsinki.
TAYLOR, ARCHER
1927 *The Black Ox*. FF Communications No. 70. Helsinki.

THOMPSON, STITH
1946 *The Folktale*. New York.

TOCHER
1971– *Tocher. Tales, Songs, Tradition. Selected from the Archives of the School of Scottish Studies*. Edinburgh.

TOLMIE, FRANCES
1911 *Journal of the Folk-Song Society*, No. 16 (Vol. 4: 143–276). London.

Von SYDOW, C. W.
1948 *Selected Papers on Folklore*. Copenhagen.