BOOK REVIEWS

A Dictionary of the Older Scottish Tongue. Ed. A. J. Aitken. Chicago: Part XIX, Law-Levetenand, 1961; Part XX, Levetenand-General—Lokfast, 1962; Part XXI, Lokhol(e)—Lyv(e)tennandry, 1964.

These are the three concluding parts of Volume III of DOST, covering the letters H-L. Part XXI includes a Preface to Volume III, a Combined Register of Works Quoted, a list of Additions and Corrections for H-L, and an Index of Variant Spellings.

The Combined Register, covering 20 double column pages, certainly comprises the fullest convenient bibliography of Scottish literature and records, both printed and manuscript, that has so far appeared for the period before 1700, and will become an indispensable instrument of historical and literary research. It may be seriously suggested that the Scottish Dictionaries Joint Council should consider reprinting this list for sale in booklet form. It would undoubtedly be widely welcomed.

Normally, a dictionary is understood to be a source for finding the meanings of obscure words, but DOST is far more than this. It is providing a full record of the Scottish language before 1700, and by so doing ranges over every aspect of the nation's life and work. The three parts under review, for example, contain the following numbers of entries to, inter alia, these subjects: agricultural implements, 10; apprenticeship, 3; arms and armour, 16; boats, 12; buildings and parts of buildings, 30; clothes and cloth, 70; crafts, 20; fishing, 18; folklore, 24; food, 10; furnishings, 7; games, 5; harness, 5; harvest and treatment of grain, 21; hunting and fowling, 6; land use, 33; mills, 9; mining, 8; numismatics, 16; peat, 4; rope making, 6; servants, 14; stock, 29; transport, 9. Reference must also be made in particular to the detailed entries under *law* and *lord* that must be amongst the fullest treatments given to these subjects in the dictionaries of any country. In this respect, DOST (in conjunction with the Scottish National Dictionary for the period following 1700) is amply fulfilling the intention of its founder, Sir William Craigie, who contemplated, about

1919, a series of "period dictionaries"[1] that would supplement and partly supersede the great Oxford Dictionary and eventually provide a full and detailed historical record of the English tongue wherever and in whatever variety spoken. A comparison of the entries for *law*, *lord*, and similarly substantial words in DOST and SND with those in the Oxford Dictionary shows how amply the two period dictionaries are succeeding in this aim.

The method of DOST, is, briefly, to give for each entry, the head form followed by its variant spellings, its etymology, including the earliest dates of occurrence in the parent language or dialect, and a breakdown of its various senses and shades of meaning. Each sense is illustrated by a quotation from the earliest known printed or manuscript source and thereafter by a representative chronologically arranged series of quotations, each chosen to illuminate a fresh aspect of the sense. In this way the words can be seen at work syntactically, and the dated quotations make easy the study of semantic developments, and of changes in pronunciation (through spelling), over a period of time. The content of the quotations may also suggest how innovations in material culture or new fashions in clothes or weapons, for example, go hand in hand with changes in terminology. Indeed, when the Dictionary is finished, one of the ready-made theses its pages will provide will be a study of terms relating to clothes and the variations in fashion and social stratification that they represent. The 70 terms in these three parts constitute over 50 per cent more entries than for any other subject, and random sampling of earlier parts suggests that the number of entries on clothes is high throughout. Original places of manufacture and sources of trade are frequently indicated by the names of particular articles like *Leith-wynd-hois*, made from 1619 in Edinburgh, *Lemistar-blak*, a high quality cloth for hose made from the expensive wool of Leominster in Herefordshire, being bought for Scotland's highest dignitaries from 1512, *Lewyn*, a kind of linen cloth from Louvain, referred to in the Exchequer Rolls in 1372 and, as a name at least, apparently localised in Scotland and the northern districts of England, and *Londo*[*u*]*ne*, applied attributively to a whole variety of types of cloth. Similar comments apply, of course, to other subjects, such as weapons, which include here the *Leith ax*, the *Lochaber axe* (an important entry), and the *Jeddart* (Jedburgh) *Staf*, or gardening, which includes *Lidingtown*, a kind of apple possibly named from Ledington or Lethington in East Lothian, and

Longavil, a kind of pear grown in Scotland from the 17th-19th centuries, possibly named after Longueville in France.

A feature of considerable interest is what might be called regionalism, marked by terms reflecting a particular occupation layer in a particular area. Thus in Shetland and Orkney and to a lesser extent in Caithness, there is a variety of terms going back to the Norse occupation of the area. Prominent in these three parts are legal terms: *lawman*, *lawricht-ayth*, *lawrichtman* and its Orkney variant *lawrikman* (with 17th century developments in sense), *lawting*, *leanger*. The name *lokman*, occurring in south Scotland and Orkney in the specialised sense of "hangman", no doubt reflects the Lowland Scots legal tradition that superseded the Norse one. Common names in this category are *lire*, "Manx shearwater", and *heavie*, "basket . . . of plaited straw". A list of such words taken from the whole Dictionary, with their earliest and latest dates, classified, for instance, in the way that has been done for the Caithness Norn by Per Thorson,[2] would undoubtedly help to interpret the material culture, institutions, habits, thoughts, and customs of the early Norse settlers and show their persistence and adaptation under later Scottish domination.

Allied to these is a group of words of geographical and onomastic interest that throw light on the appearance, character and settlement patterns of the country and its parts. Geographical terms are *lawland*, for Southern and Eastern Scotland; *les* = Latin *minor*, as in *les Scotland* (Scotland) as opposed to *mair Scotland* (Ireland); *ile* (isle) in *The Ilis*, the Western Isles of Scotland, *The North Ilis*, the Northern Hebrides, including Skye and the Outer Isles, *The South* or *West Ilis*, the Argyllshire islands; *incuntre*, *inland*, *inshyre*, used of the Lowlands, as it were the "home" counties; *infall*, a river estuary; *likarstane*, applied in Eastern Scotland to a conspicuous stone or a heap of stones; *linkis*, stretch of sandy ground near the seashore, commonly so called from the fifteenth century in the East Coast from Dunbar to Shetland, but rarely on the West Coast. Place-names and place-name elements include *law*, a hill, recorded especially in S. E. Lowland Scotland from the 12th century; *le*, the Anglo-Norman definite article, used first with appellative vernacular place-names and surnames in Latin contexts, from the 12th century, surviving until the 19th in certain legal forms; *ley*, a meadow, this sense having developed from that of a wood, then a clearing in a wood for pasture or arable purposes, found mainly as a second element of place-names

from the 12th century; *low*, a form of *loch*, surviving after *c.* 1550 only in place-names like the *Lowis*, = the sea-lochs of the West Coast; *Lukkin-buthis*, used as a place-name for those parts of the North Row, Peebles, and the High Street, Edinburgh, which contained booths or covered stalls that could be locked up; *hope*, a small bay or haven. These enshrine and perpetuate a great deal of cultural and linguistic history.

A partly overlapping phenomenon, which links up with the breakdown of the Scottish language into a group of dialects, may be described as localisation. It may involve a Middle English word like *lof* "praise, honour, glory", apparently found only in Scots after the fourteenth century, or words confined to particular localities. Examples are *liberal*, used in the sense of "legitimate" chiefly in Lanarkshire and Ayrshire; *licht*, "candle-wax", in Galloway; *leit*, used of a stack of peats of a particular size in North-East Scotland, and of a quantity of peas in the South East; *ligat*, "a self-closing gate, to prevent cattle from straying", in Dumfries and Galloway (and still confined to these regions in the modern dialect); *lynstar*, "an official appointed to measure out and so fix the boundaries of holdings within the burgh", in Elgin and Kirkcudbright, the term *linar* being generally used elsewhere; *half-manure*, an interesting form of land-holding in Galloway, in which "the landlord gave half of the seed and the tenant farmed the land and harvested the crop, half of which he delivered to the landlord as his rent". The reasons for such localisation may only be solved by extra-lexicographical research involving local history and economics, but DOST, with its chronological lists of quotations under the relevant terms, will also provide a ready-made guide to the likely sources of further information on these topics.

Although Norse and Scots mixed well, the same cannot be said for Gaelic and Scots, though a percentage of Gaelic terms has crept into the vocabulary of Scots. Those in DOST have the virtue of being uninfluenced by the terminology of the novels of Sir Walter Scott. They include, as would be expected, names of natural features like *lane*, "swampy piece of ground" (mainly Galloway), *lin*, "pool below a waterfall", *loch*, and its diminutive *lochan*. There is also a miscellany of names like *lumfad*, "West Highland galley", *lone*, "provisions for a campaign", *locht*, "boat load", *longart*, "temporary shelter or . . . hunting-lodge", *lunschoch*, "heavy great-coat", *lurg-dog*,

"bloodhound", all with a strong flavour of male or military activities; *legavrik*, applied to one of the eight annual fairs in Inverness, possibly from Gael *leth-gheamh-radh*, the winter half of the year, and if so likely to be the fair held on the 1st February; *lochmabaleis*, an obscurely-derived name for certain counterfeit coins, possibly from some such Gaelic compound as **luchd-meabhail* < *luchd*, folk, people, and Irish and (?obs.) Sc. Gael. *meabhal*, fraud, deceit but perhaps more likely to be a corruption of the place-name Lochmaben, where half merk pieces were being forged about 1572 (see E. Burns, *Coinage of Scotland*, Edinburgh 1887, 2:355); *lek-stain*, "an oven slab", here put into Holyrood House in 1626; *logie*, the fire-place of a corn-drying kiln, of uncertain origin but perhaps related to Gael. *logan*, *lagan*, a hollow or pit, which is by no means unlikely since in Mainland Scotland there is evidence for kilns being commonly dug into hillsides; and *lomeing*, applied in Galloway to a method of dehusking corn by treading with the bare feet after it has been kiln-dried, from Gael. *lom*, to unhusk. This latter process is also recorded for other areas in North and West Scotland. *Lomeing* exemplifies how DOST can throw a historical light on obsolete or obsolescent processes, by providing early sources and etymologies, not only for words referring to things, but to techniques and methods as well.

On the less material side, there are a number of entries relating to custom and belief, largely recovered from Kirk Session records and records of criminal trials. Witches were hunted by the *jober*, a man whose task was to try presumed witches by "jobin" or pricking for the devil's mark. The devil himself was euphemistically known in North-East Scotland as *halie* (holy) *man*, and a corner of land that was dedicated to him and went unploughed was the *halie man's ley*. Healing charms used by witches were *libs*, and one method of charming or of curing sickness was to put a cat or diseased chickens through the *links of the cruik*. Plough oxen could be prevented from running away by dipping the plough-irons in *lax watter* or salmon water, a curious instance of how a fish which, in later times at least, was taboo to deep-sea fishermen who refused even to name it, was regarded as having a beneficial influence on land.

Social customs or pastimes include the *lawing*, the financial contribution given by those attending a penny wedding. Kirk Sessions frequently attempted to limit this contribution so that the festivities would not become too riotous. The term, recorded

only in or near the Forth-Clyde basin, in Ayrshire, Dunbartonshire, Stirling, and West Fife, again exemplifies localisation. On Yule Day 1650 in St. Andrews, several persons were arraigned for playing *jollie at the goose*, a game of which, unfortunately, no description survives. The women had their *kimmering*, or entertaining of their women friends which, in the manuscript Newton Community Book (Ayr), was frowned upon and associated with drinking on the Sabbath. In later times the word was applied to a feast of women celebrating a birth. Further opportunities for social intercourse, again frowned upon, came on the occasion of the *Hallow-fire* on Hallowe'en, and at *Hogmanay*, of which three 17th-century forms are given in the Additions and Corrections. As a contribution to the somewhat meagre information on pre-Reformation medieval plays in Scotland, there are the 16th-century mock titles of the *lord of Bonaccord,—of obedience* or *inobedience,—of rason* or *unrason*, entertainers of the slapstick variety, little beloved of the urban authorities. Less noisily, at the last scene of all, come the *hoodies*, the hooded mutes at a funeral, twenty-four of whom followed the coffin of the Marquis of Huntly in 1636.

Chronological perspective is a *sine qua non* in contemporary local historical research if the processes and changes that have contributed to an existing situation are to be properly understood. In spite of the work of individuals and in particular of publishing societies like the Scottish History Society, vast quantities of manuscript material remain unpublished or scarcely explored. Very often, until such sources are printed, they are inaccessible to the local enthusiast, and his perspectives are, therefore, less clear. This applies equally, of course, to linguistic and to historical studies. It needs to be more widely recognised that DOST does help enormously in supplying the deficiency. It includes, for instance, words and quotations from the large mass of manuscript testamentary records in the Scottish Record Office, dating from before 1600 for some parts of the country. Professor Donaldson has pointed out the value of these for agrarian history.[3] The same sources could equally well be used for the study of domestic furnishings and equipment, on the lines of, say, F. W. Steer's *Farm and Cottage Inventories of Mid-Essex 1635-1749*, thereby throwing light on problems like social standing, the state of local craftsmanship, the spread of fashion, comparative costs, and so on. Thus the Edinburgh Testaments (80 vols.) have *luking glasis* at 8s. apiece in 1581, black ones at 26s. in 1592, a gilt one at 40s. in 1642. The

Brechin Testaments (8 vols.) refer to them in 1612. A *long sadle bed* occurs in the Brechin Testaments for 1682. This sort of information could quite well be collected in the first instance from the Dictionary, classified, and then followed up in the original sources so that the background information (which DOST must omit for reasons of space) can be added. The results would be well worth while even without consultation of the sources.

A glance through the Combined Register of Titles will show exactly how much MS material besides the Testamentary Records has been explored in the compilation of the Dictionary —burgh records, kirk sessions records, estate papers, and many more. In view of the present paucity of printed records with an emphasis on *local* source material, the Dictionary is performing a service whose value can scarcely be overestimated in making such sources known and indeed in making them usable.

DOST is a dictionary of a language that was still national, and it embodies much of the national culture before 1700. Language and culture cannot, of course, be equated, but one is a clear index to the other, and DOST is specially useful in this respect, for as one goes back in time the number and variety of sources open to historians decreases rapidly and greater dependence has to be laid on the clues that language, whether as words or place-names, can provide. Even for the present day there are spheres comparatively unexplored by the conventional historian because documentation scarcely exists—i.e. the local history of the common folk, their material culture, and so on, much of which has to be pieced together by local "fieldwork". Here again, language, in the form of dialect, comes into its own as a primary research instrument, and high quality dictionaries like DOST and SND (whose conjoint use can provide a researcher with a quick view of the geographical distribution and historical range of a word and the object, etc. to which it relates) become indispensable as a means of interpretation of much more than senses. In the opinion of the reviewer, an hour or so of the curriculum in several university departments might well be devoted to teaching students the uses of dictionaries of this type as part of the standard methodology of research.

A final word of praise must be given to the meticulous standard of editing and proof-correcting maintained by Mr. Aitken and his staff. In the 409 pages under review, the only points noted were a few trivial printer's errors such as in the

definition of *lof*. This is no mean achievement, and is an indication of the confidence with which one can use the material presented in the Dictionary.

A. FENTON

NOTES

[1] For details, see A. J. Aitken, "Completing the Record of Scots", in *Scottish Studies* 8(1964), 131.
[2] P. Thorson, "The Third Norse Dialect—That of Caithness", in *The Viking Congress*, ed. W. D. Simpson, Edinburgh and London, pp. 230-8.
[3] G. Donaldson, "Sources for Scottish Agrarian History", in *The Agricultural History Review* 8(1960), 84-5.

Traditional Country Craftsmen. By J. G. Jenkins. Routledge & Kegan Paul, London. 1965. 236 pp. 45s.

In this readable book, Mr. Jenkins has assembled a comprehensive body of material on the crafts traditional to the English and Welsh countryside. He deals first with woodland craftsmen, who spend their lives at work in the woods themselves, cutting and shaping parts of chairs, blocking out clog soles, trimming wattles for hurdle-making, preparing hoops for the cooper, burning charcoal, and so on. It is of considerable interest to note that though the charcoal burner may be held responsible for doing a great deal to change the appearance of the countryside by demolition of trees, most of the other craftsmen were able to conserve and even improve the woodlands by selective use. The chair bodgers of the Chilterns, for instance, bought their stands of beech, and cut the trees that best suited their purpose, leaving the smaller ones to grow. Gaps left were soon filled by seedlings falling from the surrounding trees, that grew and were harvested in due course. The work of these men was largely seasonal. They had to fit the rhythm of their working lives to the rhythm of growth of the material with which they worked—an interaction between nature and man that is the mark of a truly traditional craftsman working within the limits of a fairly narrow community and often of a subsistence economy. In Scotland and Ireland there is no strict equivalent to this group, partly for climatic reasons, but mainly because the accessible woodlands of these areas had been fairly well used up by mediaeval times. In fact one of the most striking points that emerges from this book as a whole is the range of the differences between England and Wales on the one hand,

and Scotland and Ireland on the other. For the latter two places, the book speaks hardly at all.

This consideration is further emphasised by the sections on village woodcrafts and on metal and straw crafts. There is a whole range of specialists or semi-specialists—the makers of osier baskets, spale baskets, and trugs, the turners of bowls, the carvers of spoons, the makers of rakes, gate hurdles and chairs, the builders of coracles, the coopers, the wheelwrights, the "broom squires" of the Hampshire-Berkshire borders, making besoms and birch brooms, the smiths, the farriers, the thatchers, the straw-plaiters. Though many of these crafts, including even coracle building, are or were known in Scotland and Ireland, the same degree of specialisation was rarely achieved. The blacksmith was also the farrier and on occasion the dentist. The joiner was also the wheelwright, and on his lathe driven by a treadle or by a large wooden wheel he turned not only wheel naves but the legs of chairs and tables and parts of spinning wheels as well. In the rural communities of these further-flung parts, where villages were almost non-existent until well through the eighteenth century, the smith and joiner were the two main general purpose craftsmen, and most other crafts, like basket-making, shoe-making, thatching, spinning and to a lesser extent weaving, were treated as part-time or spare-time occupations. In certain well-wooded areas like Speyside and Deeside, craftsmen did exist—such as turners or white coopers, making brose-caups, trenchers, and dairy utensils—who approached the southern degree of specialisation, though of these the bucket-maker at Fingzean in Aberdeenshire survives as an exception.

Most of the other crafts dealt with by Mr. Jenkins, in his two remaining sections on stone and clay crafts, and textile and leather crafts, are, with the exception of dry stone walling, scarcely rural crafts at all in Scottish or Irish terms. Again, a time factor has to be considered. Some of these crafts were rural up to the time of the Industrial and Agricultural Revolutions in the sense that a number of them, like spinning and weaving and knitting (formerly in North-East Scotland and still in Shetland), were carried on as home industries though often in the form of a dispersed industrial organisation in which the makers lived and worked at home instead of prosecuting their activities within the walls of a factory. The bundles of woven tweed lying outside many of the crofts in Lewis at the present time, waiting to be collected in a lorry and taken to the

Stornoway factory, show that this form of organisation is not dead, though its continuance must be reckoned as a comment on the insufficiently viable nature of the crofting economy there. In general, however, the crafts dealt with in this book—those of the brick-maker, potter, stone-mason, slater, tanner, currier, saddler, etc.—are and have been associated in Scotland with towns rather than the country proper, except in so far as they were carried on by country folk on a jack-of-all-trades or part-time basis.

These comments are intended to emphasise regional variation, a feature that does not appear prominently in the book. Indeed when Mr. Jenkins strays on to territory where he has not himself carried out field work he makes an occasional factual error—e.g. on page 142, it is not the *caisie* but the *büdie* that is made of dried dock stalks. The author would certainly himself agree that this is not a definitive work leaving no room for future regional studies. It is, however, a study to which all those engaged in examining and recording the crafts of their own regions should turn with gratitude and profit, and this includes the regions of England and Wales. For example, in the coopering section, the exposition of techniques and tools in the order of their use, with their standard names, forms an excellent gauge against which local differences can be measured. Mr. Jenkins's information deals essentially with coopering as a craft linked with brewing and distilling. In the fishing towns, however, coopering also flourished in relation to herring-curing, involving varying techniques, woods, tools, and names, and these have yet to be studied for the light they can throw on the development of the herring industry. In Scotland the similarity between technical terms in the coopering trade, vis-à-vis the barrelling of fish, from Lerwick to Berwick and Stranraer, is a clear sign that this is not a craft of high antiquity, but one that spread quickly from the main centres for economic reasons.

Although Mr. Jenkins has not given us much on the background economics and history of the crafts he describes, this is not a reason for criticising the book. It is simply a matter that needs to be followed up by himself and other writers at a later date. What we have here is an example of field surveying, of establishing what exists at the present time in the way of traditional crafts with their particular tools and processes that have persisted in the face of mechanisation and dispersal of goods and equipment from centralised establishments. These crafts as they survive and as they change under the influences of

such external factors are part of the history of the regions of Britain, and in this book we get what might be called the basic technical facts of history at a level that has rarely before got into the textbooks. Mr. Jenkins has provided a basis on which other researchers can build.

Traditional Country Crafts is illustrated by 54 diagrammatic drawings of groups of craft tools, and by 185 photographs. The thick paper that the publisher has chosen to use does not do full justice to the diagrams, nor do they give the impression of having been drawn by an artist in sympathy with his subject. The photographs have been carefully chosen to show the techniques of use of the various tools, with emphasis mainly on the movements of the craftsmen's hands; they also give in their illustrations of craftsmen's faces with their flamboyance, humour, and concentration, something of the very spirit of craftsmanship. The book is completed by a good bibliography and index, and Mr. Jenkins is to be congratulated on this welcome addition to the as yet scanty body of sources available for folk life research.

A. FENTON

Thomas Ruddiman: A Study in Scottish Scholarship of the Early Eighteenth Century. By Douglas Duncan. Oliver and Boyd, Edinburgh and London. 1965. 178 pp. 42s.

Thomas Ruddiman lived from 1674 to 1757. Dr. Duncan sees his death "as symbolising the decline of Latinity, and of the old humanist disciplines associated with it, as a dominant force in Scottish culture" (p. vii). The elegiac note recurs: Ruddiman "was plainly out of sympathy with the new *mystique* of textual criticism" (p. 103); "in history, as in literary criticism, he followed the fashions of an earlier epoch" (p. 141). The book ends with Joseph Scaliger's couplet addressed to George Buchanan:

> Imperii fuerat Romani Scotia limes;
> Romani eloquii Scotia finis erit.

The tone is not wholly unjustified, but Dr. Duncan is melancholy to an extent greater than either his fascinating subject or his well-written book deserves. Ruddiman was not a mere survivor; indeed, Dr. Duncan's book succeeds in demonstrating the surprising extent to which he anticipated some flourishing aspects of Scottish studies at the present day. As

editor and publisher he brought much important Scottish literature to general notice, as for instance in his contributions to Watson's edition of Drummond of Hawthornden (1711), and his publication of Allan Ramsay's original poetry (*Poems*, 1721; *The Gentle Shepherd*, 1725) and anthologies (*The Tea-Table Miscellany* and *The Ever-Green*, 1724). He was concerned with archaeology, publishing David Malcolme's *Essay on the Antiquities of Great Britain and Ireland* (1738) and Sir John Clerk's *Dissertatio de Monumentis quibusdam Romanis, in boreali Magnae Britanniae parte detectis anno MDCCXXI* (1750). (One should perhaps note Clerk's comment in his *Memoirs*: "The copies of this dissertation were never sold, but some were given away to my particular friends.") Ruddiman too was very much concerned with the achievement of the fifteenth and sixteenth century Renaissance in Scotland, a concern not limited to his favourite author, George Buchanan, whose *Opera Omnia* were edited by him and published by Freebairn in 1715, but extending to the *De Animi Tranquillitate Dialogus* (1707) of Florence Wilson (Florentius Volusenus), Gavin Douglas's translation of the *Aeneid* (1710), and the epistles of the humanist Secretaries of James IV, James V and Mary I, edited in his *Epistolae Jacobi Quarti, Jacobi Quinti et Mariae, Regum Scottorum* (2 vols., 1722-24). These in turn lead to his historical work, documentary and analytical, best illustrated by the introduction and notes which he provided for James Anderson's *Selectus Diplomatum et Numismatum Scotiae Thesaurus* (1729), and by his own *Dissertation Concerning the Competition for the crown of Scotland, betwixt Lord Robert Bruce and Lord John Baliol, in the year 1291* (1748). In a very real sense the glossary to Ruddiman's edition of Douglas's *Aeneid* laid the foundation of Scots lexicography. And, of course, he contributed greatly to the development and efficiency of the Advocates' Library.

Ruddiman, in other words, was an excellent Latinist, but he is not memorable merely as a Latinist. One's only substantial reservation about Dr. Duncan's approach is that he tends to underestimate the importance, both of Ruddiman himself and of the period in which he lived. Thus it is at least an exaggeration to say (p. 154), "By choosing to write in Scots, Ramsay contracted out of serious literature as it was understood in his day." Dr. Duncan notes that, in contrast to Ruddiman, Robertson and Hume were historians "who followed the example of Bolingbroke and Voltaire in dissociating themselves from the race of antiquaries, despising them for their lack of

polish and for their interest in a period of history which had nothing to teach civilized men" (p. 140). He should have added (with all possible deference, in particular to David Hume) that the modern student of history will find much more of value in Ruddiman's collections than in the more "polite" histories—indeed for some purposes Ruddiman remains indispensable. To no small extent Scottish studies have maintained the pattern which he established. Dr. Duncan has performed an important service in redirecting attention towards him.

I should add in conclusion that 'Messrs. Oliver and Boyd have left themselves open to none of the strictures which Dr. Duncan directs at Ruddiman as an exponent of the art, as opposed to the trade, of printing. The book is handsomely produced.

JOHN MACQUEEN

Schottische Volksmärchen. Edited by Hannah Aitken and Ruth Michaelis-Jena. Die Märchen der Weltliteratur—Neue Folge. Eugen Diederichs, Dusseldorf. 1965. 380 pp. DM 15.80.

Although several similar projects are at present in preparation, the volume of Scottish folk-tales recently published in that long established and highly successful series *Märchen der Weltliteratur*, is to our knowledge not only the first collection published this century, exclusively devoted to the Scottish traditional tale, but also the first ever to bring together stories in Gaelic and English, from both printed sources and manuscripts based on field-work within the last two decades. That such an important book which is a "first" in so many respects should appear in Germany, with both texts and commentary in German, is perhaps regrettable but does by no means detract from the achievement. Especially since the formation of the International Society for Folk-Narrative Research, the world of the folk-tale has become considerably smaller, and exchange of information within Europe and from Continent to Continent, very often based on personal contact, is now one of the routine features in this field of research. It is therefore to be welcomed that at least a selection of what Scotland has to offer in this genre should be made widely known in a country which, particularly through people like the late Walter Anderson and Kurt Ranke, has done so much for the advancement of our understanding of this aspect of oral tradition. Any review must therefore begin by congratulating both the general editor,

Friedrich von der Leyen, and the two ladies in charge of this volume on the addition of a Scottish collection to an already long list of volumes from many countries.

Any selection from printed sources of Gaelic material necessarily has to lean heavily on J. F. Campbell's *Popular Tales of the West Highlands*, and it is therefore not surprising that twenty-one out of the thirty-eight stories from Gaelic speaking areas are German renderings of the English translations of the original Gaelic texts in Campbell's three volumes. Apart from one story from Mrs. Grant of Laggan's *Superstitions of the Highlanders of Scotland* (1811), these are the earliest contributions from the Gaelic speaking areas (1860-62), whereas at the other end of the period covered stand a couple of tales from MacDougall and Calder's *Folk Tales and Fairy Lore in Gaelic and English* (1910). The time-span for the twenty-four items from Scottish English tradition is very similar, ranging from Robert Jamieson's *Popular Ballads and Songs* (1806) to the Folklore Society's *County Folklore* Vol. VII (1914). Here Chambers' *Popular Rhymes of Scotland* has been the main source with ten tales. The selection of material is therefore largely based on nineteenth-century printed sources, and heavily weighted in favour of material from the Gaelic speaking areas, particularly if one adds to this the eight items from the unpublished collections of the School of Scottish Studies which bring the total of Gaelic items up to 46, as against 24 English tales. There is no unpublished example amongst the latter.

The picture conveyed is therefore by and large one appropriate to the last century, and this is reinforced by a lengthy quotation (pp. 353-4) from the Introduction to Carmichael's *Carmina Gadelica*, describing the atmosphere of a *ceilidh*, a description which even seventy years ago would be noted for its romantic overtones. One might be prepared to make allowances for this if it was in fact made clear that much of what the volume contains has to be seen against a nineteenth-century backcloth. However, not only is this omitted but the key sentence in the short account of the Scottish story-telling tradition which follows the main part of the book, quite categorically states in the present tense that "Scotland—Highlands and Lowlands—is full of old stories and traditional tales" (p. 352). As this is the day and age of "projected images", the German reader, or any other reader for that matter, is consequently left with the impression that it is still quite common, particularly in the Hebrides, to hear stories of the

type collected in the last century and told under conditions as described by Carmichael. Such an impression would, of course, be quite erroneous, when the trained modern collector has to search very hard indeed in order to find a storyteller with a variant of an international tale-type, and when quite often his search is by no means successful.

Stronger reliance on unpublished material would probably have helped to correct the "image". It is, of course, to be welcomed that at least one-tenth of the total collection has been gleaned from comparatively recent field-work. On this side of the North Sea, these items must be regarded as the really new contribution the volume under review is making to our knowledge of the Scottish traditional tale. Again, the account given of the nature of these eight tales and the circumstances under which they were collected and found their way into the book is to a certain extent misleading. They are described as "manuscript translations into English after tape-recordings in Gaelic", when in fact the English versions, from which the German translations were made, are based on microfilms held by the School of Scottish Studies in Edinburgh, of manuscript transcriptions of the original Gaelic recordings (not tape-recordings!) made in the Hebrides by the late Dr. Calum I. Maclean for the Irish Folklore Commission in the years 1946-7, before the School existed. The original recordings unfortunately no longer exist. Valuable as these examples from mid-twentieth century Gaelic oral tradition may be, they should have been balanced by similar items from the Scots or English tradition of the same period. Notably, some of the many excellent instances of tinker story-telling or of Brucie Henderson's very craftsmanlike tales might have been included, even if only to demonstrate that the tradition was still as two-stream as a hundred years ago.

To the scholar, as distinct from the purely naïve reader of folktales, the commentary of a work of this kind is, of course, of the greatest interest. On pp. 362-82, the editors have supplied detailed notes for all seventy stories, giving the provenance and source of each item, and frequently also lists of motifs and of parallels in the traditions of other countries. Cross-references are normally either to Grimm's Fairy Tales themselves and/or to Friedrich von der Leyen's *Das deutsche Märchen und die Brüder Grimm* (in the same series as the volume under review). From a German point of view, this may be useful; it may even do many of the tales more justice as tales than mere reference

to a tale-type index, but one would nevertheless have wished for more frequent categorisation according to the widely accepted classification in Aarne's and Thompson's *Types of the Folktale* although this is by no means always satisfactory from the point of view of Celtic tradition. Failing this, Christiansen's and Ó Súilleabháin's *Types of the Irish Folktale* (FFC.188) should certainly have been consulted in order to establish the position of at least the Scottish Gaelic tales within the framework of Gaelic story-telling as a whole.

While praising the achievement as such and adding favourable comment on the very fine way in which this volume has been produced by the publishers, we must draw attention to a certain imbalance which favours the nineteenth-century printed story and neglects recent oral tradition. One can only hope that such publications of Scottish folktales as are planned for such series as *The Folktales of the World* and *Fabula Series A* will remedy this omission and draw heavily on unpublished material, much of it collected when time had begun to run out fast for the collector.

W. F. H. NICOLAISEN

LIST OF BOOKS RECEIVED

Some of these books may subsequently be reviewed in *Scottish Studies*.

Leslie Mitchell: Lewis Grassic Gibbon, by Ian S. Munro. Oliver & Boyd, Edinburgh 1966. Pp. xiv+224. 42s.

The Traditional and National Music of Scotland, by Francis Collinson. Routledge and Kegan Paul, London 1966. Pp. xvii+294. 63s.

Aspects of Antiquity, by Elise M. Wilson. Abertay Historical Society Publication No. 11, Dundee 1966.

Dunbar: A Critical Exposition of the Poems, by Tom Scott. Oliver & Boyd, Edinburgh 1966. Pp. 360. 50s.

University of Glasgow Social and Economic Studies, Occasional Papers No. 5: Industrial Movement and the Regional Problem, by G. C. Cameron and R. D. Clark. Oliver & Boyd, Edinburgh 1966, for the University of Glasgow. 220 pp. 21s.

A Guide to Glenesk Folk Museum [Tarfside, Angus], by Colin Gibson. pp. 24.

Scots in Italy in the 18th Century, by Basil Skinner. Trustees of the National Galleries of Scotland, Edinburgh 1966. pp. 44.

The Historical Architecture of Scotland, by John G. Dunbar. Batsford, London 1966. pp. 268. 5 gns.