

SCOTTISH STUDIES 41

Scottish Studies

The Journal of the School of Scottish Studies
University of Edinburgh

Volume 41

2025

About the journal

First published in 1957, *Scottish Studies* has striven to reflect the mission of the University of Edinburgh's School of Scottish Studies, founded in 1951 to preserve and explore Scotland's rich and diverse cultural and linguistic heritage. Research topics have included archaeology and pre-history; demographics; ethnography and ethnology; history; land use and distribution; fishing and seafaring; material culture; onomastics; oral culture and traditions; and spiritual beliefs, customs and observances. Today, in addition to these topics, we welcome research centering on Scotland's evolving landscapes, physical and social, and the peoples who call Scotland home in the twenty-first century.

Publication

Scottish Studies is an Open Access journal published by the University of Edinburgh. All material is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0 International \(CC BY-NC-SA 4.0\) licence](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/4.0/).

Scottish Studies is published online by Edinburgh Diamond at journals.ed.ac.uk/ScottishStudies.

Submissions

Scottish Studies encourages submissions of original research, in English or Gaelic, from affiliated and independent scholars worldwide. Prior to submitting, researchers should contact the editor directly to request the Author Guidelines. Following initial editorial scrutiny, articles are subject to double-blind peer review.

Reviews are normally commissioned, but we welcome readers' suggestions of works that they would like to see reviewed.

Please note that all communication should be addressed by email directly to the editor, Virginia Blankenhorn, at virginia.blankenhorn@ed.ac.uk, using the subject-line 'Scottish Studies'.

Editor

Virginia Blankenhorn

Editorial Advisory Board

Ronald I. M. Black	Carl Lindahl
Michel Byrne	Emily Lyle
Ewen A. Cameron	Neill Martin
Hugh Cheape	Donald E. M. Meek
Joshua Dickson	John D. Niles
Robert Dunbar	Jane Pettegree
Tiber Falzett	John Shaw
Barbara Hillers	Duncan Sneddon
William Lamb	Natasha Sumner

ISSN: 2052-3629 (Online)

<https://doi.org/10.2218/ss.v41>

© 2025 by individual authors

Cover photograph: Calum Johnston, Eoligarry, Barra, 1972. Photo: Peter Cooke. School of Scottish Studies Archives, Ref. V_3b_8264. By permission.

Contents

Contributors	vi
Editor's Note	vii
Frans Buisman Pipers' Canntaireachd and Scottish Gaelic: Basic Elements and Expressive Variability	1
Ewen A. Cameron 'We in Scotland have to make our stand for pure Liberalism': John M. Bannerman and Scottish Politics, 1932–1968	23
Liam Alastair Crouse Iain Peatarsan (1916–1990), Neach-chruinneachaidh Beàrnaraidh na Hearadh	43
Trevor Hill 'Both sides of the Tweed': Relations, Tensions and Identity of Scottish Backhold and Cumberland and Westmoreland Wrestling	65
Sheila M. Kidd <i>Cumha do Mhuinntir a' Bharra-Bhric: An Eye-witness Account of Evictions in 1840s Argyll</i>	85
Virginia Blankenhorn Review article: <i>John Dewar's Islay, Jura and Colonsay: A Bird's Eye View</i>	103
Jane Pettegree Review article: <i>The Complete Songs of Robert Tannahill: A Timely Appreciation</i>	110
Reviews	
<i>Derick Thomson and the Gaelic Revival</i> . Petra Johana Poncarová.	119
<i>Before and After Coal: Images and Voices from Scotland's Mining Communities</i> . National Galleries of Scotland.	122
<i>Beàrnaraidh na Hearadh: 'Tis Fifty Years Since – A Study of Life in a Hebridean Island Community</i> . Susanne Barding.	125
<i>Jock Duncan – The Man and his Songs: Traditional Songs and Bothy Ballads from the Repertoire of Jock Duncan of Fyvie and Pitlochry</i> . Edited by Peter Shepheard.	128
<i>Memories of Musical Lives: Music and Dance in Personal Music Collections from Australia and New Zealand</i> . Edited by Rosemary Richards and Julja Szuster.	128
<i>WEBSPINNER: Songs, Stories, and Reflections of Duncan Williamson, Scottish Traveller</i> . John D. Niles.	131
<i>Scottish Religious Poetry from the Sixth Century to the Present</i> . Edited by Linden Bicket, Emma Dymock and Alison Jack.	134
<i>Where Men No More May Reap or Sow: The Little Ice Age: Scotland 1400–1850</i> . Richard D. Oram.	136
Obituary: Nancy Currier Dorian, 1936–2024	138

Contributors

Ronald I. M. Black, Honorary Fellow, Celtic and Scottish Studies, University of Edinburgh.

Virginia Blankenhorn, Honorary Fellow, Celtic and Scottish Studies, University of Edinburgh.

†**Frans Buisman**, University of Amsterdam.

Ewen A. Cameron, Sir William Fraser Professor of Scottish History and Palaeography, University of Edinburgh.

Liam Alastair Crouse, Sabhal Mòr Ostaig, University of the Highlands and Islands.

Stuart Eydmann, Honorary Fellow, Celtic and Scottish Studies, University of Edinburgh.

Scott Gardiner, Traditional singer and performer.

Trevor Hill, Department of English Languages and Cultures, University of Warmia and Mazury, Olsztyn, Poland.

Sheila M. Kidd, Senior Lecturer in Celtic and Gaelic, University of Glasgow.

Wilson McLeod, Honorary Fellow, Celtic and Scottish Studies, University of Edinburgh.

Jane Pettegree, Honorary Research Fellow and Lecturer, University of St Andrews.

John Shaw, Honorary Fellow, Celtic and Scottish Studies, University of Edinburgh.

Duncan Sneddon, Department of Celtic and Scottish Studies, University of Edinburgh.

Angus J. L. Winchester, Emeritus Professor of Local and Landscape History, University of Lancaster.

Editor's Note

After spending several months of 2024 scanning volumes 1–33 of *Scottish Studies*, I became newly aware of how much territory the journal has covered since its founding in 1957. With this volume, contributors continue to delve into familiar research themes and to explore new ones.

Scottish historians have long found an outlet for their research in *Scottish Studies*. Professor Ewen Cameron's article in this volume examines the life and legacy of John M. Bannerman, Lord Bannerman of Kildonan, Scottish rugby international, champion of Gaelic and of the Highlands, proponent of Scottish Home Rule, and mainstay of the Scottish Liberal Party during its darkest days in the 1930s and 1940s. Dr Sheila Kidd also considers Highland history in her study of a song by a previously unknown nineteenth-century poet, Catrìona Nic an Fhlèisdeir, which bears witness to her community's emotional upheaval upon learning that they were to be 'cleared' from the estate of Alexander Campbell of Monzie, Barbreck, Lochaweside, in 1840.

The School of Scottish Studies itself has long provided food for discussion in our pages – but rarely has one of the School's own staff been a subject of enquiry. In this volume, Liam Alastair Crouse examines the life and career of one of the institution's most gifted and diligent collectors, the late Ian Paterson (1916–1990) of Berneray, Harris. Complementing Crouse's paper, we also publish a review of Susanne Barding's monumental study of Berneray in the early 1970s, *Beàrnaraidh na Hearadh: 'Tis Fifty Years Since – A Study of Life in a Hebridean Island community*.

Sport has surely merited more space in the journal, given how large it looms in Scotland's cultural life. A step in the right direction is Trevor Hill's paper, which examines the evolving relationship between traditional forms of wrestling popular on 'both sides of the Tweed', and shows how definitions of style and regional identity have come to distinguish Scottish Backhold from Cumberland and Westmoreland Wrestling, despite many functional similarities between them.

Finally, we are particularly pleased to publish a major article by the late Frans Buisman (1942–2002). A prodigious linguist and highly-regarded scholar of the piping repertoire, Buisman submitted his paper shortly before his untimely death; but because of the article's complexity and its author's unavailability to answer questions, the manuscript remained in limbo, making its way through the hands of several reviewers, not all of whom agreed about what he wanted to say. We are therefore hugely grateful to Professor Joshua Dickson of the Royal Scottish Conservatoire, whose careful editing has at last made it possible to publish this important work, in which Buisman shows how the phonological features of the Gaelic language shaped the 'language' of canntaireachd so that it could guide pipers in realising the music's 'expressive variability'.

With a regular publication schedule, we can now publish timely reviews of significant works before they fall out of print. In one of two review articles, Jane Pettegree assesses Fred Freeman's CD compendium *The Complete Songs of Robert Tannahill*, completed last year to mark the 250th anniversary of the poet's birth. In the other, we provide a generalist's view of Ronald Black and Christopher Dracup's *John Dewar's Islay, Jura and Colonsay*, the first of a projected series of ten volumes from the Dewar manuscripts. Other reviews assess collections of poetry, song and narrative; consider studies of the Gaelic revival, of Scotland's 'little ice age', and of music-making among the Australian diaspora; and describe the National Galleries of Scotland's 2024 exhibition *Before and After Coal*, which marked forty years since the closure of Scotland's coal mines and the transformation of their communities.

We had hoped by now to have announced the publication online of all of the earlier volumes of *Scottish Studies*. These are now in the hands of our publisher, Edinburgh Diamond, who say they should be available before too much longer. Meanwhile, we have prepared a comprehensive Index of volumes 1–40. Please get in touch if you would like a copy.

VIRGINIA BLANKENHORN

Editor, *Scottish Studies*

20 January 2025

